



Technical Committee 184: Industrial automation systems and integration
Subcommittee 4: Industrial data

TC 184/SC4 N791

ISO Committee Draft Ballot Results
for 10303-509.2

Product data representation and exchange: Application interpreted construct:
Manifold surface

The ballot was circulated among SC4 members for its vote on 1998-06-29. 14 of our eighteen P-members responded to the ballot:

COUNTRY	VOTE	WITH COMMENT
Australia	Agree	
Canada		
China		
France	Abstain	X
Germany	Agree	
Hungary		
Italy	Agree	
Japan		
Korea, Republic of	Agree	
Netherlands	Agree	
Norway	Agree	
Portugal	Abstain	
Russia	Agree	
Spain	Agree	
Sweden	Agree	
Switzerland	Abstain	
United Kingdom	Agree	X
United States	Agree	X

The Secretariat has reviewed the ballot responses, and in consultation with the Chair and concurrence from the project leader, proposes that, the next draft 10303-509.2 will go forward for registration as a DIS.

This document is also available digitally through SOLIS via ftp or www:

http://www.nist.gov/sc4/step/parts/part509/cd2/bal_cmt/

Address reply to:

ISO TC 184/SC4 Secretariat

National Institute of Standards and Technology

Building 220, Room A127

Gaithersburg, MD 20899 USA

Phone: +1-301-975-3982 Telefax: +1-301-975-4694 Email: sc4sec@cme.nist.gov url - <http://www.nist.gov/sc4/>

BALLOT COMMENTS

FRANCE

Lack of Resources

UNITED KINGDOM

ISSUE NUMBER UK-509-01

AUTHOR: Ray Goult

CLAUSE: Foreword piv

CLASSIFICATION: Minor Editorial

DESCRIPTION: As always the list of parts is not completely up to date. It should correspond to the latest list of approved projects, it certainly omits part 107 and possibly others.

PROPOSED RESOLUTION: Update this list, and, if necessary the accompanying boilerplate text. It might be appropriate to replace this with a URL reference to an up to date list.

ISSUE NUMBER UK-509-02

AUTHOR: Ray Goult

CLAUSE: 4.2.1 p8.

CLASSIFICATION: Minor Technical

DESCRIPTION: In WR3 to avoid infinite recursive loops of mapped items it would be useful to ensure that the mapped_item has a mapping_source containing a shell_based_surface_model.

PROPOSED SOLUTION:

Amend WR3

ISSUE NUMBER UK-509-03

AUTHOR: Ray Goult

CLAUSE: 4.2.1 p8 and 4.3.1 p 14

CLASSIFICATION: Minor Technical

DESCRIPTION: There is an inconsistency between the documentation of WR11 and the coding and internal comment of 4.3.1 msf_curve_check with respect to use of polyline.

In WR11 the only apparent restriction on polyline is that no of points = 3.

In 4.3.1 EXPRESS in line comment there is the additional requirement that a polyline shall only be used as an intersection_curve - but no coding to validate this requirement. This restriction is not present in the descriptive text for the function.

PROPOSED SOLUTION: If this is (as it seems to me) a reasonable requirement then the check on polyline should be moved to apply to the case where cv is of type surface_curve under this there should be a further check fo cv being of type intersection_curve before checking no of points in curve_3d\polyline.points.

ISSUE NUMBER UK-509-04

AUTHOR: Ray Goult

CLAUSE: 4.3.1 msf_curve_check description. p 15

CLASSIFICATION: Minor Editorial

DESCRIPTION: In the documentation requirement on polyline appears on same line as that for non self-intersection of B-splines and offsets. There is no logical connection.

PROPOSED RESOLUTION: Start description of self_intersect requirement on a new line.
{ See above issue for possible revised description of polyline constraints. }

ISSUE NUMBER UK-509-05

AUTHOR: Ray Goult
CLAUSE: Annex C figure C.7 p30.
CLASSIFICATION: Minor Technical
DESCRIPTION: Diagram shows loop and path as ONEOF subtypes of topological_representation_item
In part 42 the declaration is ONEOF(vertex,, (loop ANDOR path))
As a minor editorial point in several digrams the names overlap on boxes and connectors.
PROPOSED SOLUTION: Revise diagrams.

UNITED STATES

ISSUE NUMBER: USA PART 509 – 01
AUTHOR: USA
CLAUSE: Contents, pg ii
CLASSIFICATION: Minor, Editorial
DESCRIPTION: Should be two spaces, instead of 4, between sub clause number and name.
PROPOSED SOLUTION: Adjust spacing
RESOLUTION:

ISSUE NUMBER: USA PART 509 – 02
AUTHOR: USA
CLAUSE: Foreword, pg iv
CLASSIFICATION: Minor, Editorial
DESCRIPTION: Dash should precede each entry in part list, not a dot.
PROPOSED SOLUTION: Change from dot to dash
RESOLUTION:

ISSUE NUMBER: USA PART 509 – 03
AUTHOR: USA
CLAUSE: Scope, pg 1; BUT this is a general issue throughout the document
CLASSIFICATION: Minor, Editorial
DESCRIPTION: There should be two blank lines after major clause titles.
PROPOSED SOLUTION: Add one more blank line.
RESOLUTION:

ISSUE NUMBER: USA PART 509 – 04
AUTHOR: USA
CLAUSE: Scope, pg 1; BUT this is a general issues throughout the document.
CLASSIFICATION: Minor, Editorial
DESCRIPTION: There should be a dash after 'NOTE'.
PROPOSED SOLUTION: Add dash after notes per SD 537.
RESOLUTION:

ISSUE NUMBER: USA PART 509 – 05
AUTHOR: USA
CLAUSE: 3.1, pg 3; BUT this is a general issue throughout the document.
CLASSIFICATION: Minor, Editorial
DESCRIPTION: Font should be 14 pt for clause title.
PROPOSED SOLUTION: Increase font size.
RESOLUTION:

MBER: USA PART 509 – 06
AUTHOR: USA
CLAUSE: 3.4.1, pg 4
CLASSIFICATION: Minor, Technical

DESCRIPTION: Since definition is normative, 'may' should be replaced by 'shall'.

PROPOSED SOLUTION: Change wording.

RESOLUTION:

ISSUE NUMBER: USA PART 509 – 07

AUTHOR: USA

CLAUSE: 4.2.1, pg. 7

CLASSIFICATION: Minor, Editorial

DESCRIPTION: In NOTE 3 the phrase 'for example' should be offset with commas.

PROPOSED SOLUTION:

RESOLUTION:

ISSUE NUMBER: USA PART 509 – 08

AUTHOR: USA

CLAUSE: 4.1, pg. 8

CLASSIFICATION: Minor, Technical

DESCRIPTION: There are EXPRESS errors in WR2 and WR3 of manifold_surface_shape_representation. MAPPED ITEM should be MAPPED_ITEM.

PROPOSED SOLUTION: Correct the EXPRESS by replacing MAPPED ITEM with MAPPED_ITEM.

RESOLUTION:

ISSUE NUMBER: USA PART 509 – 09

AUTHOR: USA

CLAUSE: Annex C

CLASSIFICATION: Minor, Editorial

DESCRIPTION: Font for word Figure and the titles should be 14 pt font.

PROPOSED SOLUTION:

RESOLUTION:

Filename: sc4n791.doc
Directory: I:\sc4\docs
Template: C:\Program Files\Microsoft Office\Office\Normal.dot
Title:
Subject:
Author: Mike Washington
Keywords:
Comments:
Creation Date: 11/24/98 9:10 AM
Change Number: 6
Last Saved On: 11/27/98 4:37 PM
Last Saved By: mgraham
Total Editing Time: 51 Minutes
Last Printed On: 12/01/98 3:18 PM
As of Last Complete Printing
Number of Pages: 4
Number of Words: 901 (approx.)
Number of Characters: 5,136 (approx.)